

Reprinted from the INTERNATIONAL BULLETIN OF MISSIONARY RESEARCH, July 1996, by permission of the Overseas Ministries Study Center, New Haven, Conn. For details visit www.OMSC.org.

PENTECOSTAL PHENOMENA AND REVIVALS IN INDIA: IMPLICATIONS FOR INDIGENOUS CHURCH LEADERSHIP

Late nineteenth- and early twentieth-century Protestant mission leaders and missionaries, among them John R. Mott and James S. Dennis, shared the prevailing optimism that progress and Christian civilization would march forward together until the kingdom of God had been established on earth. However, around the turn of the century there was also a growing cadre of evangelical Christians and missionaries that became pessimistic about the future of human history. Holding a premillennial view of the coming kingdom, they believed that the time for Christ's return was swiftly approaching and that only a supernatural endowment of power would enable the faithful to evangelize the millions of non-Christians.[1]

For these evangelicals, the predicted outpouring of the Holy Spirit (Joel 2:28-29) and the praxis of mission found in the Book of Acts modeled God's intended plan for the Great Commission. But most did not expect a replication of the visions, speaking in tongues, prophecies, healings, exorcisms, and other unusual spiritual phenomena that accompanied the early expansion of the faith, as chronicled by Luke. While longing for the restoration of apostolic power and the gifts of the Holy Spirit, they assumed that the actual expressions of such power would appear in more or less traditional and noncontroversial forms. A.T. Pierson, for example, citing James 5:13-16, did not hesitate to affirm (within limits) the value of prayer for the sick in missionary evangelism,[2] but the more dramatic signs of divine intervention were beyond his purview.

Others, however, had fewer hesitations about the manifestations of spiritual gifts. In the spirit of John 14:12, they prayed for the return of apostolic power to break the hold of Satan over the "heathen" and bring a great end-time harvest of souls. Two Indian revival movements--1860-ca. 1881 and 1905-7--were marked by supernatural interventions and spiritual gifts for evangelism. The appearance of Pentecostal phenomena in these two revival movements provides an opportunity to assess long-term results of the restorationist aspirations of these "radical" evangelicals. Both revivals prompted believers to evangelize, fostered indigenous modes of worship, raised claims about New Testament gifts (Rom. 12:6-8; 1 Cor. 12, 14) and offices (apostles, prophets [Eph. 4:11-12]), and exasperated missionaries, whose status and authority now came into question.

Miracles and Evangelism

While few Christians doubted God's ability to perform miracles, Protestant missionaries and their Roman Catholic and Orthodox counterparts generally

speaking did not anticipate healings, tongues, and prophecy, or expect the emergence of new "apostles." [3] Even the followers of Edward Irving (1792-1834), founder of a controversial charismatic renewal movement in England, did not link miraculous gifts with evangelism. [4]

But this was not the case with radical evangelical missionaries. Because of the slow pace of conversions among non-Christians, the brevity of time in which to reach them with the gospel message, and the influence of teachings on faith healing and premillennialism, radical evangelicals paid considerable attention to biblical passages addressing the ministry of the Holy Spirit. Interest in the prediction of the Old Testament prophet Joel that in "the last days" God would "pour out" his Spirit on Israel's sons and daughters and on male and female servants drew special attention. They noted Jesus' promise that the Holy Spirit would enable the disciples to witness from Jerusalem to the remotest parts of the earth (Acts 1:8), and they reflected on the events of the Day of Pentecost reported in Acts 2. Many also pondered the longer ending of the Gospel of Mark, where Jesus announced that extraordinary signs would follow gospel preaching: exorcisms of demons, speaking in tongues, picking up snakes and drinking poison without injury, and healing the sick (Mark 16:17-18). [5]

Missionaries who prayed for and expected paranormal phenomena lived on the fringes of the missionary community. Two events in particular sparked heated discussions. First, E. F. Baldwin, a missionary to North Africa, contended in 1889 that the instructions of Jesus in Matthew 10:7-10 framed the one true New Testament pattern for missions. But his expectations of the miraculous, and especially his negative assessment of the financial operations of most mission agencies, drew strong rebukes. Expressing the sentiments of the majority, Mrs. H. Grattan Guinness, editor of *The Regions Beyond* (East London Institute for Home and Foreign Missions), sniffed that for the heathen, "miracles cannot enlighten their dark minds, or soften their hard hearts. . . . Our aim is to enlighten, not to astonish." [6]

In the second instance, several Kansans left for Africa, having been inspired by the theology of A. B. Simpson and a revival in the Topeka YMCA. [7] Embarking for Sierra Leone in 1890 and confident of biblical promises of physical healing and the utility of Pentecostal tongues for preaching the Gospel (Acts 2:5-11), their outfitting included neither medicine nor grammars and dictionaries. When attacked by fever, three of them died, having refused quinine. [8]

Revival in Tinnevely and Travancore

Thirty years before the tragedy of the Kansans, and largely unknown to most Western Christians, paranormal happenings were taking place in the Indian context. Beginning in 1860 among the Shanars (a low caste) in the state of Tinnevely (part of present-day Tamil Nadu) and soon reaching into neighboring Travancore (the southernmost region of present-day Kerala), "Pentecostal"

phenomena were pointedly associated with gospel witness.

The seeds of the revival can be traced to the ministries of Karl Rhenius, a Prussian missionary sent out in 1814 by the Church Missionary Society (CMS), and Anthony Norris Groves, an independent missionary from England who arrived in 1833. Rhenius emphasized the principles of self-support and self-propagation for the Indian churches, and he ordained Indian catechists (which led to his discharge from the CMS). With Groves came instruction in the millennial eschatology of the Plymouth Brethren (imminent coming of Christ, hope for the outpouring of the Holy Spirit, spiritual gifts, and an egalitarian concept of ministry). Groves was a pioneer figure in advocating simpler apostolic methods in mission work.[9]

The awakening of 1860 began after news reached India of revivals in the United States, England, and Ulster in 1858-59. It came on the heels of the Sepoy Rebellion of 1857 and 1858, a failed revolt against British rule. The leader of the revival, John Christian Aroolappen, had been trained as an Anglican catechist by Rhenius and had been an understudy of Groves. In his diary for August 8, 1860, Aroolappen recorded: "In the month of June some of our people praised the Lord by unknown tongues, with their interpretations. . . . My son and a daughter and three others went to visit their own relations, in three villages, who are under the Church Missionary Society, they also received the Holy Ghost. Some prophesy, some speak by unknown tongues with their interpretations." [10] In addition to speaking in tongues and prophecy, other happenings included intense conviction of sin among nominal Christians, conversions of unbelievers, prayer for the sick, concern for the poor, visions, and people falling down under spiritual power. The appearance of spiritual gifts in the ministry of Aroolappen clearly indicated an open-ended expectation of the miraculous.

From the outset, the revival took an indigenous course. Missionaries and Western money had little or no influence (the revival, however, did spread among British soldiers). After receiving Spirit baptism, believers shared their faith with non-Christians. This activity notably included women--unmistakable evidence of Pentecostal anticipation: daughters and female servants would prophesy (Joel 2:28-29; Acts 21:9).[11] Evangelists, following the pattern of New Testament apostles and evangelists as modeled by Aroolappen, traveled on "faith" (without salary or pledged support) and set their own itineraries. Ashton Dibb, a CMS missionary and observer, reported that in Aroolappen's church "there was a baptism of the Holy Spirit which filled the members of this church with a holy enthusiasm; and caused them to go everywhere preaching the gospel, in demonstration of the Spirit and of power." [12]

Not surprisingly, the traditional control of "native" churches and their clergy by paternalistic mission societies left little room for such dispensing of the Spirit's gifts. On one occasion, a missionary complained that several believers had announced that they had seen visions in which appeared the names of twelve

persons to be appointed as apostles and evangelists, and seven as prophets.[13] From the ethnocentric perspective of missionaries, Indian Christians required extended tutelage; the missionaries contended that a sound English-language education in Western culture and theology must precede any attempt to evangelize in the vernacular. Only then could the door be opened to mass conversions and a Christian civilization in India. As recently as 1858, at the South India Missionary Conference at Utakamand (in present-day Tamil Nadu), this view had been reaffirmed.[14] In the minds of many missionaries God had providentially entrusted India to British rule to ensure its evangelization.[15]

Little wonder, then, that missionaries were unprepared for the evangelizing initiatives taken by Indian Christians affected by the revival. The subsequent flood of conversions amazed the missionaries. Dibb reported:

It does certainly seem to have the merit of being the first entirely indigenous effort of the native church at self-extension. "There is little doubt," writes one of our friends from Madras, "but that the Spirit of the Lord is in an extraordinary manner at work in portions of our South Indian Missions. Church of England clergy are backward in accepting such movements as these; but the unanimous testimony is now pretty decided. . . . It is indeed a new era in Indian Missions, that of lay converts going forth without purse or scrip to preach the Gospel of Christ to their fellow-country-men, and that with a zeal and life we had hardly thought them capable of." [16] (Dibb's emphasis)

Soon the awakening extended into nearby Travancore among CMS churches and again met with considerable success. Prominent leaders there included two "prophets," Kudarapallil Thommen and the Brahmin convert Justus Joseph. From the ministry of the latter arose the "Revival Church" in 1875, better known as the Six Years Party, from the belief that Christ would return in 1881.[17] Although revival fervor had waned in Tinnevely by 1865, the movement in Travancore continued into the twentieth century, though in diminished proportions.[18] This "Pentecostal" movement preceded the American Pentecostal movement by several decades.

Severe criticisms mounted over certain "excesses"; one observer called them dreadful.[19] A missionary with the American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions in Madura (part of present-day Tamil Nadu) wrote to Rufus Anderson, "We commenced a prayer-meeting, but the excitement soon became uncontrollable, and we were obliged to stop and address ourselves to individuals." On the next day, he cautioned the people "to avoid, as far as possible, giving way to their feelings." [20] Missionaries detected lingering traces of heathen culture in the lack of emotional restraint. Complaints also included Anglican criticisms of independent and unordained clergy, the establishing of the prophetic office, the pronouncing of controversial predictions, and the growth of schismatic congregations.[21] By the time of the second revival in 1905,

Aroolappen and the other evangelists and prophets from forty years earlier had been largely forgotten or simply dismissed as misguided enthusiasts.

Revival of 1905-7

With growing concern for the unconverted millions, Christians continued to pray for special power. By the end of the century, the use of Pentecostal imagery (e.g., "outpouring," "baptism in the Holy Spirit") had become quite accepted in Wesleyan holiness circles (e.g., William Taylor) and among reformed evangelicals (e.g., Dwight L. Moody, Robert P. Wilder).[22] In late 1897, leaders of various mission agencies in India issued a special call to prayer, which became an annual event. "Feeling the deadness and stagnation of the work and the crying need, manifest everywhere, for some special manifestation of the life and power of God the Holy Ghost," they found an immediate and warm response among a wide cross-section of Christians.[23]

When revival fires burned in Wales in 1904, many interpreted this as the start of a worldwide outpouring of the Spirit. It immediately gained notoriety for public confessions of sin, prayer in concert, seeking the baptism in the Holy Spirit, a de-emphasis on preaching, vibrant singing, and remarkable changes in the moral behavior of tens of thousands of converts. An observer and promoter of the revival, Jessie Penn-Lewis, declared the "remarkable manifestations of the Spirit" as clear indicators that Pentecost had come.[24]

Missionaries in India paid close attention to these reports and those of other revivals. In January 1905, the Methodist Press in Madras published a booklet in English entitled *The Great Revival*, with translations in Tamil, Telugu, and (later) Kanarese. Through newspapers, booklets, journals, and other mission periodicals, missionaries and Christians of major language groups were enabled to keep abreast of the events.

Two months later, in March 1905, the earliest stirrings occurred in the Khasia Hills in the northeast (present-day Meghalaya, formerly a part of Assam), followed by events beginning on June 30 at the Mukti Mission in southern India founded by the famed Pandita Ramabai.[25] At stations staffed by Welsh Calvinistic Methodist missionaries in the Khasia Hills, believers attended prayer meetings in earnest expectation that the Holy Spirit would accomplish there what had taken place in Wales. Before long, stories similar to those in Wales and the 1860 revival began to spread; they included such phenomena as visions and dreams, conviction and confessions of sin, "prayer-storms" (hours spent in intense and often loud prayer), dancing, falling over under the power of the Spirit, the appearances of supernatural lights, confrontations with evil powers and exorcisms, repayment of debts, conversions of non-Christians, prophecies, and miraculous provisions of food.[26]

Within weeks, Baptist, Christian and Missionary Alliance, CMS, Danish Lutheran,

Methodist, and Presbyterian publications reported comparable activities in their own ranks. From Madras, Bombay, and Kerala in the south, to the Punjab and Gujarat in the northwest, to Bengal in the east, the revival advanced. Published accounts offered readers exciting descriptions of public repentance of sins and conversions on the otherwise stony ground of India.[27] In contrast to the earlier revival, however, this awakening had no preeminent leader. Furthermore, speaking in tongues (with claims of persons miraculously receiving known languages, as well as unknown tongues) came later (April 1906) rather than at the initial stage? At the same time, emphasis on prayer for the sick and the imminent return of Christ did not receive the prominence that the Kansans or A. B. Simpson might have expected. Still, like the previous awakening in Tinnevely and Travancore, the revival brought renewal and growth.

By the spring of 1907, the ardor of revival had begun to die down. There were significant exceptions, however, particularly after news arrived of the Pentecostal movement in North America and Europe and the arrival of Pentecostal missionaries.[29]

Cross-Cultural Conflicts

As in the case of the 1860 awakening, missionaries with revivalist backgrounds generally fared better at keeping an open mind to such manifestations and emotional responses, often standing in awe of the happenings as divinely ordained and believing that the subcontinent would now be evangelized.[30] Nevertheless, most struggled with the spiritual phenomena, specifically the lack of decorum in worship as well as prophecy and tongues. How could apparently unrestrained emotionalism and irrational mutterings advance the faith? Such questions troubled the missionaries far more than the Indians. In the midst of the controversy, Pandita Ramabai, one of the most respected Indian Christians, cautioned the missionaries

not to interfere with God's work by laying their hands on it. Let the revival come to Indians so as to suit their nature and feelings. God has made them. He knows their nature, and He will work out His purpose in them in a way which may not conform with the ways of Western people and their lifelong training. Let the English and other Western Missionaries begin to study the Indian nature, I mean the religious inclinations, the emotional side of the Indian mind. Let them not try to conduct revival meetings and devotional exercises altogether in Western ways and conform with Western etiquette. If our Western teachers and foreignised Indian leaders want the work of God to be carried on among us in their own way, they are sure to stop or spoil it.[31]

Despite such advice, Western missionaries found it difficult to unload their cultural baggage. Shaped intellectually by Enlightenment precepts and their own theological presuppositions, they balked at the notion that God had intended all

the features of New Testament evangelism to continue after the first century. To their way of thinking, only fanatics, whose deeds inevitably produced disorder and confusion, sought for such gifts and ecstatic experiences. Just as disconcerting, how could any respectable Christian suggest that the Spirit offered such benevolence to converts still colored by the wickedness of pagan culture? It was simply unthinkable for Christian spirituality, church leadership, and mission polity.

Indigenous Church Leadership

For Indian Christians, the revival brought the Spirit's gifts for the building of Christ's church in ways previously unimaginable. Responsibility for leadership and evangelism now rested on indigenous shoulders; God had conferred dignity and power not only on the sons and daughters but on the male and female servants as well. With strong indigenous dimensions in both revivals, Indian Christians, either immediately or gradually, became key players.

This maturation contributed to the establishment of the National Missionary Society (NMS) in 1905 during the first year of the awakening. Utilizing Pentecostal imagery, NMS leaders issued an "Appeal to Indian Christians" to evangelize their own nation, stating:

After two hundred years of Protestant Missionary effort from foreign lands, are we not yet ready to take up our own burden, and live and die for our country? . . . The hour of India's opportunity has struck! We shall not fail our God in the day of His power.

India is awakening. God is speaking to our age and to our own land in the mighty reviving work of His Spirit. In Wales we have seen a nation well nigh reborn in a day. In Assam we have heard of His mighty power. In parts of Northern, Western and Southern India the revival has already begun. A revival of whom--and for what? The spirit of pentecost is arousing the Church today, not for ecstatic emotions or pleasant feelings as an end in themselves, but in order to give service for the unsaved. . . .

Breathes there a man with soul so dead
Who never to himself hath said,
"This is my own, my native land"?

Yes, it is our own! . . . in the solemn obligation alike of ownership and of opportunity, of sacrifice and responsibility. It is ours! to win or lose; to save or

to neglect.[32]

The outpouring of the Spirit on peoples who had been dominated politically, militarily, economically, and ecclesiastically by colonial masters signaled that the hour for indigenous leadership had arrived. Not surprisingly, this development coincided with increasingly hostile resentments toward British rule. The revivals thus helped prepare the Indian churches for national independence, in part, through influencing the founding of the NMS and the later National Christian Council.[33]

Conclusion

Twentieth-century Pentecostals, charismatics, and some evangelicals have made the fulfillment of Joel's prophecy the centerpiece of their missiology. Ardent expectancy of the imminent coming of Christ has predisposed them to prioritize verbal proclamation for the salvation of lost souls.[34] Nevertheless, Christians may discover in the promised blessing more than freedom in worship and the power to evangelize. As the Indian awakenings show, revivals have frequently led to social change and institutional restructuring. New and gifted leaders have emerged, pressing for independence from Western ecclesiastical traditions. They have become prominent voices for righteousness and justice in oppressive contexts, lending their energies to these and other indispensable aspects of Christian witness. In North America, African-American Pentecostals from the first decade of this century have understood the Spirit's outpouring more in terms of empowerment for sanctified living and reconciliation than have their white colleagues.[35] In South Africa, black and East Indian Pentecostal theologians have explored the larger meaning of the Spirit's work in their own country and in 1988 issued the ground-breaking declaration *A Relevant Pentecostal Witness*, which denounced their government's apartheid policy as a structural sin.[36] Hispanic-American and Latin American Pentecostals have also creatively engaged in reenergizing mission theology.[37]

Given the magnitude of problems facing the world and the churches today, Pentecostals and evangelicals with traditional millennial agendas and strong hesitations about the involvement of the faithful in the broader applications of witness have much to learn from other Christians--including those in India of past generations--upon whom the Spirit has been outpoured.

Notes

1. Timothy P. Weber, *Living in the Shadow of the Second Coming* (New York: Oxford Univ. Press, 1987), pp. 43-81.
2. Arthur T. Pierson, *Forward Movements of the Last Half Century* (New York: Funk & Wagnalls, 1905), pp. 389-408; see also A. J. Gordon, *The Holy Spirit in Missions* (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1896), pp. 105-8.

3. Joseph Schmidlin, *Catholic Mission Theology* (Techny, Ill.: Mission Press, S.V.D., 1931), pp. 341-53; James J. Stamoolis, *Eastern Orthodox Mission Theology Today* (Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis Books, 1986).
4. Plato E. Shaw, *The Catholic Apostolic Church, Sometimes Called Irvingite* (Freeport, N.Y.: Books for Libraries Press Reprint, 1972), p. 233.
5. A. J. Gordon, *Ministry of Healing* (Harrisburg, Pa.: Christian Publications, n.d.), pp. 21-23, 245-46.
6. Mrs. H. Grattin Guinness, "Missionaries According to Matt. X: A Critique," *The Regions Beyond*, April 1899, p. 110.
7. A. B. Simpson, founder of the Christian and Missionary Alliance, was a well-known advocate of faith healing and believed that miracles would accompany missionary evangelism. See *The Holy Spirit of Power from on High*, 2 vols. (Harrisburg, Pa.: Christian Publications, n.d.), 1:200-201.
8. Robert Needham Cust, *Evangelization of the Non-Christian World* (London: Luzac, 1894), pp. 106-7.
9. See G. H. Lang, *Anthony Norris Groves* (London: Thynne, 1939).
10. G. H. Lang, ed., *The History and Diaries of an Indian Christian* (London: Thynne, 1939), pp. 23-28, 144-45; see also letter from David Fenn in "North Tinnevelly Itinerancy," *Church Missionary Record*, n.s., 5 (August 1860): 248-53.
11. Lang, *History and Diaries*, pp. 151, 186.
12. Dibb's comment appeared in the *Indian Watchman*, February 1861, and is quoted in *Memoir of Anthony Norris Groves, Compiled Chiefly from His Journals and Letters*, 3d ed. (London: James Nisbet, 1869), p. 616.
13. Quoted in Lang, *History and Diaries*, p. 199.
14. "Resolutions of the South India Missionary Conference, Ootacamund" (1858), in *History of Christianity in India: Source Materials*, ed. M. K. Kuriakose (Madras: Christian Literature Society, 1982), pp. 170-75.
15. For example, *Report of the Centenary Conference on June 9th-19th, London, 1888*, 3d ed., ed. James Johnston (New York: Fleming H. Revell, 1888), p. 204.
16. Ashton Dibb, "The Revival in North Tinnevelly," *Church Missionary Record*, n.s., 5 (August 1860): 178.

17. W.S. Hunt, *The Anglican Church in Travancore and Cochin, 1816-1916* (Kottayam, Kerala: Church Missionary Society Press, 1920), pp. 160-68.
18. *Ibid.*, pp. 191-92.
19. Lang, *History and Diaries*, p. 173.
20. Rufus Anderson, *History of the Missions of the American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions in India* (Boston: Congregational Publishing Society, 1874), p. 380.
21. Hunt, *Anglican Church*, pp. 159-63, 167-68.
22. William Taylor, *Ten Years of Self-Supporting Missions in India* (New York: Phillips & Hunt, 1882), pp. 99-102; W. H. Daniels, ed., *Moody: His Words, Work, and Workers* (New York: Nelson & Phillips, 1877), pp. 396-403; R. P. Wilder, "Power from on High," in *A Spiritual Awakening Among India's Students* (Madras: Addison, 1896), pp. 242-8.
23. T. Walker, "Present Religious Awakenings in the Church in India," *Church Missionary Review* 58 (May 1907): 280-90.
24. (Jessie) Penn Lewis, "The Revival," *Christian Patriot*, October 7, 1905, p. 6.
25. Helen S. Dyer, *Pandita Ramabai*, 2d ed. (London: Pickering & Inglis, n.d.), pp. 99-110; Nicol Macnicol, *Pandita Ramabai, Builders of Modern India* (London: Student Christian Movement, 1926), pp. 116-23.
26. Walker, "Present Religious Awakenings," pp. 283-84; J. Pengwem Jones, "The Revival in the Khasia Hills," *Indian Witness*, June 7, 1906, p. 359.
27. J. E. Robinson, "Days of Power and Blessing at Asansol," *Indian Witness*, December 21, 1905, p. 803.
28. Maud Weist, "Editorials," *India Alliance*, September 19, 1906, p. 30; "Pentecost in Mukti, India," *Apostolic Faith* (Los Angeles), September 1907, p. 4. See my "From East to West: The Influence of Early Twentieth-Century Indian Revivalism on the Development of Pentecostalism in the Western Hemisphere" (paper presented at the twenty-fifth annual meeting of the Society for Pentecostal Studies, Toronto, Canada, March 7-9, 1996), pp. 9-10.
29. Alfred and Lillian Garr arrived in Calcutta in late 1906 and began preaching in January 1907. See Max Wood Moorhead, "Pentecost at Calcutta," *Cloud of Witnesses to Pentecost in India*, Pamphlet Number Four (March 1908), pp. 7-12; cf. F. B. Price, "Manifestations Genuine and Counterfeit," *Indian Witness*, April 18, 1907, p. 251.

30. Robinson, "Days of Power," p. 804; J. Speicher, "Spiritual Gifts; Their Presence Among Native Christians, and Their Importance to Successful Missionary Work," *Baptist Missionary Review* 10 (November 1904): 405-13.
31. Pandita Ramabai, "Stray Thoughts on the Revival," *Bombay Guardian*, November 4, 1905, p. 9.
32. "An Appeal to Indian Christians by the Founders of the National Missionary Society" (1905), in *History of Christianity in India*, ed. M. K. Kuriakose (Madras: Christian Literature Society, 1982), pp. 292-93.
33. Donald Fossett Ebright, "The National Missionary Society of India, 1905-1942" (Ph.D. diss., Univ. of Chicago, 1944); cf. Frank W. Wame, *The Revival in the Indian Church* (New York: Board of Foreign Missions, Methodist Episcopal Church, 1907), pp. 27-30; J. Edwin Orr, *Evangelical Awakenings in India in the Early Twentieth Century* (New Delhi: Christian Literature Institute, 1970), pp. 145-58.
34. Melvin L. Hodges, *A Theology of the Church and Its Mission* (Springfield, Mo.: Gospel Publishing House, 1977), pp. 98-126; cf. Miroslav Volf, "Materiality of Salvation: An Investigation in the Soteriologies of Liberation and Pentecostal Theologies," *Journal of Ecumenical Studies* 26 (Summer 1989): 447-67.
35. Herbert Daughtry, "A Theology of Black Liberation from a Pentecostal Perspective," *Spirit: A Journal of Issues Incident to Black Pentecostalism* 3, no. 2 (1979): 6-14.
36. *A Relevant Pentecostal Witness* (Chatsglen, Durban: n.p., 1988); Louw Alberts and Frank Chikane, eds., *The Road to Rustenburg: The Church Looking Forward to a New South Africa* (Cape Town: Struik Christian Books, 1991).
37. Eldin Villafafie, *The Liberating Spirit: Toward an Hispanic American Pentecostal Social Ethic* (Grand Rapids, Mich.: Eerdmans, 1993). See also "Summary Report," *Gathering of Latin American Pentecostals; Salvador, Bahia, Brazil, January 6-9, 1988*, available at the Assemblies of God Archives, Springfield, Mo. 65802.

By Gary B. McGee

Gary B. McGee, a contributing editor, is Professor of Church History at Assemblies of God Theological Seminary, Springfield, Missouri.